

**Minutes of The Ad-Hoc Working Group Meeting of Thai-EU FLEGT VPA on TLAS
Description No.1/2017**

On Tuesday, April 25, 2017 at Ruaypanya 2 meeting room,

Maruay Garden Hotel, Bangkok

Participants

1. Mr.Chonlatit Surasawadi Director General , RFD
2. Mr.Sukan Sirichantaradilok Legal Officer, Professional Level, The Customs Department
3. Ms.Benjamaporn Promperm Trade Officer, Professional Level, Department of Foreign Trade
4. Pol.Col. Worasak Bandit Inspector Super Intendent, Crime Suppression Division About Natural Resources and Environment(Land Administration)
5. Mr. Anucha Janta Legal Officer, Professional Level, Natural Resources and Environment
6. Ms.Pornpen Worawilawan Deputy director, Forest Industry Organization
7. Ms.Chonlanet Prechajaruensri Forestry Technical Officer Professional Level, Forest Land Management Division, RFD
8. Ms.Preeyanun Muengsan Forestry Technical Officer Practitioner Level, Reforestation Promotion Office, RFD
9. Mr.Somsak Prompathima Legal Officer, Professional Level, Forestry Law Division, RFD
10. Mr.Panus Siriarporntham Director of Forest-checkpoint Division, Forest-checkpoint Division, RFD
11. Mr.Rattana Thaingam Forestry Technical Officer, Senior Professional Level, Forest Research and Development Bureau
12. Mr.Krek Meemoogkij Secretariat, Tree Bank
13. Mr.Virot Tipin Coordinator, Sustainable Development Foundation (SDF)
14. Mrs.Yingluck Patiphanthewa President of Private Forest Plantation Cooperative Limited, Private Forest Plantation Cooperative Limited
15. Mr.Ekkasit Aneksitthisin Secretary-General, Thai Timber Association
16. Mr.Pingsun Wang Secretary, Thai Panel Product Industry Club

17. Asst.Prof. Ethipol Srisaowalak Legal expert, Chulalongkorn University
18. Ms.Warangkana Rattanarat Project Coordinator, RECOFTC
19. Mrs.Ratchanee Pothan Forestry Faculty, Kasesart University representative
20. Mr.Tumnoon Akarapin Director, Permission Bureau
21. Mr.Banjong Wongsrisoontorn Director of Forestry Certification Office, Director of TEFSO, Royal Forest Department: RFD

Attendees

1. Mr.Alexander Hinrichs Reginal Coordinator Asia, EU FLEGT Facility in Asia, EFI
2. Ph.D. Somrudee Nicro Consultant to the EU FLEGT Facility, EFI
3. Ms.Erica J.Pohnan Consultant FAO-FLEGT Programme Asia-Pacific, FAO
4. Mr.Piya Kengpenkhae Legal Officer,Practitioner Level forestry law Division, RFD
5. Mr.Sapol Boonsermsuk Director of International Forestry Cooperation Office, RFD
6. Mr.Jongsatid Angwittayatorn CEO, Nakorn Si Parawood Co., Ltd
7. Mr.Wiroat Kanaphongsa Manager, Thai Panel Product Industry Club
8. Mr.Thanun Ounkomol Committee of the Federation/ Vice President of Thai Furniture Industry Club, The Federation of Thai Industries
9. Ms.Pawinee Udommai Legal Officer, Chulalongkorn University
10. Ms.Pantalika Pongchababnapa Trade Technical Officer Professional Level, Department of Foreign Trade
11. Ms.Rungnapa Wattanachian Manager, The Federation of Thai Industries
12. Mr.Surakit Danchonwikit Assistant Manager, The Federation of Thai Industries
13. Mr.Natnarong Aiamme Private Forest Plantation Cooperative Limited
14. Mr.Narong Meenuan FSC Manager, TPPIA
15. Ms.Arunwan Petchsung Thai Hevea Wood Association
16. Mr.Surakit Mobandit Dissemination Technical Officer, RFD
17. Ms.Nichanan Chuekoksung Forestry Technical Officer,
18. Mr.Prateep Lisakulruk Forestry Technical Officer, Professional Level, RFD
19. Mr.Phajhon Sitdhigun Forestry Officer, Professional Level, RFD
21. Mrs.Porntip Koto Forestry Technical Officer, Practitioner Level, RFD

22.	Ms.Wicha Wichainarong	Standard Technical Officer, TISI
23.	Mr. Thada Suwanwimon	Forestry Technical Officer, Professional level, RFD
24.	Ms.Pattayasorn Panthong	Finance and Accounting Officer, Experienced Level, RFD
25.	Mr.Krittasin Yammoon	Forestry Technical Officer, RFD
26.	Ms.Pitchaya Wetchasa	Coordinator, Thai - EU FLEGT Secretariat Office (TEFSO)
27.	Ms.Thanaree Lapwongsiwanan	Financial Officer, RFD
28.	Mr.wanchalerm Kranto	Officer, RFD
29.	Ms. Panjit Tansom	Technical Consultant, Thai - EU FLEGT Secretariat Office (TEFSO)
30.	Ms. Isiyanee Samrit	Database Officer, Thai - EU FLEGT Secretariat Office (TEFSO)
31.	Ms. Kessara Sanmongkol	Operation Officer, Thai - EU FLEGT Secretariat Office (TEFSO)

Absentees

1. Director of Planning and Information Bureau, RFD
2. Representative of the Department of Trade Negotiations
3. Representative of Community forest network in 5 province of eastern forest
4. Representative of Mueng Ling Family Forest Network
5. Representative of the Tree Bank
6. Representative of the Board of Trade of Thailand
7. Representative of the Sawmill Association
8. Representative of the Federation of Thai Industries

The meeting started at 09.00 A.M

Mr. Mr.Chonlatit Surasawadi, the Director General of the Royal Forest Department is the chairman of the meeting on Thai- EU FLEGT VPA under the topic of The Ad-Hoc Working Group Meeting of Thai-EU FLEGT VPA on TLAS Description No.1/2017.

The purposes of the meeting

1. To understand the legality of the Timber Legality Assurance System (TLAS)
2. To present and develop the TLAS system
3. To prepare for FLEGT VPA negotiations between Thailand and the EU

/The expected results...

The expected results

1. The working group are understand basic of the TLAS
2. The diagram is drafted and guidelineed for the development of Thailand's TLAS system.

Agenda item 1: Notifications

Mr.Chonlatit Surasawadi, the Director General of the Royal Forest Department informed the meeting that The Royal Forest Department is willing and prepared to support the VPA FLEGT Program to achieve the goals in a given period.

Resolution The meeting be informed.

Agenda item 2: Certify the Minutes of The Ad-Hoc Working Group Meeting of Thai-EU FLEGT VPA on TLAS Description No.1/2017 On Tuesday, April 25, 2017

Mr.Panus Siriarporntham, The representative of Forest Protection and Fire Control Bureau asked to edit the minute's page 5 from "then draft the ministerial regulation" to "then draft the Ministry's announcement"

Resolution The meeting be informed.

Agenda item 3: Accordance with The Ad-Hoc Working Group Meeting on Supply Chain Control No. 1/2016 on 30th August 2016

Mr. Banjong Wongsrisoontorn, Director of Division of Forestry Certification Office and Director of TEFSO reported that the accordance with The Ad-Hoc Working Group Meeting on Supply Chain Control No. 1/2016 on 30th August 2016 consists of revising the detailed on the diagram of Supply Chain Control which Thai – EU FLEGT Secretariat Office done editing.

Resolution The meeting be informed.

Agenda item 4: Notifications

Dr. Alexander Hinrichs , Asian FLEGT Consultant from the European Forestry Institute (EFI) presented basic information about the elements of preparation Control of imported timber (look at the attachment 1) and answered questions about the matter. The attendees were focus on scrutiny and timber import process. The data were analyzed as follow

Elements of TLAS is divided into 5 parts

1. Legality Definition (LD)

Legality definition is an important appendix in the Voluntary Partnership Agreement (VPA). The compilation of the appendix is not just the incorporation the existing law into the appendix. But it must be the result of stakeholder dialogue to gain acceptance from all parties.

2. Supply Chain Control: SCC

Supply Chain Control is one of the elements in the Timber Legality Assurance System. It will be proven from land type, processing, transportation, and trade process to confirm the legality of wood and their products.

3. Verification

The Verification must know roles of who is an inspector, where and how to inspect. The word “who” could be government agencies, private or civil society sector. For instance, Indonesia gives civil society organization a chance to participate in the verification process.

In the past, Thailand has Mini-Field Test once to test whether the verification identified in the Legality Definition can be effectively implemented. The next field test will begin in May. Experts will come to test and improve the verification process to be most effective.

4. FLEGT Licensing Procedure: LP

EU rules EUTR to prevent illegal logging into EU. So, if any country has FLEGT license it will be possible to bring the timber into the European Union without having to conduct a validation. For FLEGT Licensing Procedure, There must be a specific organization or agency to do this role. (Example of FLEGT License of Indonesia is in the attachment 1)

5. Independent Audit: IA

Agencies that play a role in independent audits must not be stakeholder and it must be a specializes in monitoring systems. It must be investigated and assessed whether the monitoring system is as assigned. Then Submission of the results to the two committees which consists of Partner and EU (Joint Implementation Committee: JIC) to continue debugging. The independent Audit requires TOR writing to assign roles and must be mutually accepted by both parties.

Example of TLAS legal guarantee system of Indonesia and Liberia (see attachment 1)

The development of TLAS in each country may be different. But it must consists of the 5 elements which mentioned above initially. Dr. Alexander Hinrichs exemplifies the legal guarantee system of Indonesia and Liberia in the presentation. The example in the presentation shows that the system in Thailand is similar to Liberia because Liberia also has a verification agency that is

also appointed under the Forest Department. But in Indonesia, they use a private company and/or civil society serves as such verification.

Timber exportation control (see attachment 1)

The European Union consists of 28 member countries. It is a commercial market where timber products are imported into the EU market. It is divided into 2 groups as 1) wood from VPA member country and 2) wood from non-VPA member country. The non-VPA member country requires Due Diligence System (DDS) to confirm the legality of the source.

The Due Diligence System consists of 3 elements

1. Information: Show information related to wood imports.
2. Risk Assessment: Evaluation based on credibility of country of origin and type of timber.
3. Risk Mitigation: If it is found that wood products are at risk, it is necessary to obtain additional evidence to confirm the legality.

Because Thailand is a country that imports wood from neighboring countries and transform it into various wood products to export, so we can use the document review system or C/O to reduce the risk to be accepted.

Mr. Chonlatit Surasawadi, the Director General of the Royal Forest Department expressed appreciation and appreciated that this meeting was very useful to start developing other timber processes especially the process of exporting timber products to the European Union. Thailand has focused on importing and exporting wood for long time. It is well known that some Thai laws interfere with the operation and monitoring. To reduce the interference, the government sector has to adjust too. The Royal Forest Department as a stakeholder, will consider to reduce the risk of timber sources and control their imports. It is expected that the year 2017 will be able to solve the problem to a certain extent and the electronic systems will be used to develop processes for more modern.

Resolution be informed.

Agenda item 5: Notifications

Mr. Banjong Wongsrisoontorn, Director of Division of Forestry Certification Office and Director of TEFSO of RFD asked the stakeholders to be divided into 2 groups to consider 2 topics, as follows

Group 1: To discuss on importing control of Thailand.

Group 2: To discuss on the Independent Audit Context of Thailand.

Consulting Summary of 2 groups

Group 1: To discuss on importing control of Thailand.

MS. Rungnapa Wattanavichian, Researcher of DARC, a representative of Group 1 reported the result of the topic as follow

Group 1 is interested in timber import method of Vietnam. So they offer that timber product which has FLEGT, CITES, FSC and other certification which is internationally recognized could be imported automatically to Thailand. In the case of timber without acknowledge certification could be used the Due Diligence System or DDS to prove the legality.

However, if there is any question about the information provided in the document, Thailand is able to request additional documents to reduce the risk. And use the screen document method instead of divided the documents by the risk level of species and location like Vietnam. In the future, Thailand has to establish the law to enforce because Thailand exports timber products to many countries around the world. The import standard should be the same standard for easy conducting.

Dr. Alexander Hinrichs, Asia Regional FLEGT Consultant From the EFI provided feedback on groupings of certificates endorsed by the government and private sector. For instance, PEFC FSC certified by private sector should be under due diligence system.

Group 2 To discuss on the Independent Audit Context of Thailand.

Mrs. Arunwan Petchsang, manager of Thai Hevea Wood Association, the representative of Group 2 reported the result of the discussion on the Independent Audit Context of Thailand as follow

Group 2 presented TLAS by offering the idea to appoint the National Platform Committee between the stakeholders and secretariat office which has the roles to provide information, coordinate, respond complains and organize the meeting to summarize and improve operations every year. Any institute who wants to be Independent Audit must not be the VPA stakeholder. And those institute have to know how to verify entrepreneurs and the TOR should be set up to determine the role of the institute. Group 2 presented the institutes which are possible to perform an independent audit as follow

1. Thai-forest certification network
2. Private sector
3. Educational institution
4. Special purpose entity
5. Thai industrial standard institute

For Inspection agency, Group 2 offered the electronic system to investigate. And the Royal Forest Department may empower the authority concerns for investigation.

Resolution be informed.

Agenda item 6: other matter

MS. Rungnapa Wattanavichian, Researcher of DARC presented the introduction of the project on the guideline of unlock unregulated species on private land which is the one of gap/issue paper. The project will use industrail standard 14061 and Chain of Custody to test the big and small operators that consider to valude and compliance to FLEGT.

According to the project, she would like to invite the relevant working groups to attend the meeting and discuss about the project.

Next step:

- TEFSO gathers information from the meeting for reference on working with LD field-test consultants that have a scope on suggestion and developing TLAS structure.

Meeting finished at 16.25

Ms.Isiyanee Samrit

Minutes Recorder

Ms.Chatdinee Konman

Minutes Translator

Mr. Banjong Wongsrisoontorn

Director of TEFSO

Ms. Panjit Tansom

Technical Consultant

Minutes Verifier